



**UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
REGION IX
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105**

February 4, 2008

Ms. Alice B. Carlton, Forest Supervisor
Plumas National Forest
P.O. Box 11500
Quincy, CA 95971-6025

Subject: 2nd Draft Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement for Watdog Project,
Feather River Ranger District, Plumas National Forest, Butte and Plumas
Counties, California (CEQ # 20070533)

Dear Ms. Carlton:

The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has reviewed the above-referenced Draft Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement (DSEIS) pursuant to the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA), Council on Environmental Quality (CEQ) regulations (40 CFR Parts 1500-1508), and Section 309 of the Clean Air Act.

EPA reviewed the Draft and Final Supplemental Environmental Impact Statement (DSEIS) and provided comments to the U.S. Forest Service (USFS) on October 16, 2006 and May 9, 2007 respectively. We rated the DSEIS as Environmental Concerns - Insufficient Information (EC-2) because of concerns regarding cumulative watershed effects. We recommended the selection of Alternative D, or a less harvest intensive alternative, as a way to reduce impacts to riparian resources, water quality, soils, and native plants (from noxious weeds). Our concerns remained upon reviewing the Final Supplemental EIS.

We appreciate the additional clarifications in the 2nd Supplemental DEIS and have rated this document as Environmental Concerns – Adequate (EC-1). We continue to have concerns regarding cumulative impacts to watersheds and short-term impacts to old-forest species and recommend consideration of Alternative D or a less harvest intensive alternative for selection, which will meet the project purpose and need with reduced impacts.

We appreciate the opportunity to review this 2nd Supplemental DEIS. If you have any questions, please contact me at (415) 972-3846 or Karen Vitulano, the lead reviewer for this project. Karen can be reached at 415-947-4178 or vitulano.karen@epa.gov.

Sincerely,

/s/ Karen Vitulano for:
Nova Blazej, Manager
Environmental Review Office

Enclosures: Summary of EPA's Rating Definitions